

Cities Alliance Consultative Group Meeting 8 November 2011 Maputo, Mozambique

Meeting Report

Key Decisions and/or Follow-up Actions:

Independent Evaluation: COWI will take Member feedback into account when preparing draft final report, which will be circulated to EXCO for comment within the next two months.

Cities Alliance Charter: Members ratified the edits made to Charter subsequent to its adoption at the CG's November 2010 meeting in Mexico City and reviewed by EXCO at its March and November 2011 meetings, but deferred consideration of additional edits proposed to Members by World Bank lawyers the week prior to the meeting.

EXCO Member Rotation: France, SDI and AUSAID were nominated to replace Germany, Chile and UNEP on EXCO. A vacancy on the Board remains for the replacement of South Africa as a Developing Country representative.

Business Plan FY12-FY14: Approval of the FY12 work programme was ratified by the CG. Members provided comments to the Secretariat, which will be taken into consideration for the next update of the Business Plan, particularly with respect to strengthening the outcome indicators and results framework of the plan.

Advocacy / International Fora: A working group of Members, including HFHI, Norway and SDI, will work with the Secretariat on CA advocacy strategy and plans, including key advocacy messages to promote at WUF VI and Africities. Other Members are encouraged to join the working group.

Catalytic Fund: Endorsed the theme of Youth and the City for the FY12 cohort.

Business Matters: The FY12 programme budget, including Secretariat budget, was ratified by the CG. The Secretariat will be following up on Members delinquent in their membership dues, and reporting to EXCO during 2012 on membership issues.

Members agreed to hold a one day retreat at some point in time to discuss the Urbanization Review work which was presented to the CG and generated heated debate. Because of lack of time and importance of issue for CA's business model, members agreed this is a discussion that needs to be held. The Sxecretariat will look for options for such a retreat.

Next Meeting of CG: Vietnam was the nominated venue, pending invitation of the Government.

Meeting Summary

8 November 2011

Attendance: Co-Chairs: Allaoua (World Bank); Meeuwissen (UN-Habitat). See Annex I for full list of Members and Observers participating in the meeting.

Venue: Joaquim Chissano Conference Center, Maputo, Mozambique

Item 1: Opening and Welcome/Adoption of Agenda/Clearance of Previous Meeting Report

- a. The Co-Chairs requested that the presentation on the Urbanisation Review be moved up the agenda to follow the Secretariat's Business Plan presentation. Due to the availability of participants, the Policy Advisory Forum discussion was moved prior to the COWI presentation and the EXCO report back was presented after the COWI presentation
- b. No additions/comments were made to the Mexico City meeting report, October 2010. The report was approved.
- c. Members also requested that the Maputo meeting report be circulated within three weeks after the meeting.

See Annex II for the final agenda.

Item 2: Follow up from Policy Advisory Forum (PAF)

The PAF Chair reported back on the 7 November PAF on theme of Financing of African Cities, noting how the event can be used in a country context to bring partners together, share information, mobilize stakeholders, and bring energy for the urbanization agenda. As with the Mozambique PAF, this implies stepping into the country's space, engaging with them on the programme design. Feedback will be solicited from Members, local participants and others about the event. An evaluation form was circulated to CA Members during the course of the meeting, and a Portuguese version will be adapted to solicit inputs from the Mozambican participants.

During discussion, Members commented on various aspects of the 7 November PAF, and also made specific suggestions for future PAF design, including:

- a. Plan preparatory and follow-up activities for each PAF to prepare stakeholders to actively participate in the Forum, and to take next steps after the event, facilitated by the Secretariat.
- b. Use a more varied format to allow for more intimate discussions.
- c. Limit formal presentations from CA members.
- d. Include more representatives from civil society and private sector.
- e. Make use of the information produced from the event, for subsequent dissemination.
- f. Consider holding more frequent PAFs, including multiple PAFs in same country to increase and strengthen participation and debate.
- g. Focus PAFs on country programme countries.

Item 3: Independent Evaluation 2011 by COWI/AS

The evaluation team leader from COWI A/S presented the draft findings and recommendations from the Independent Evaluation. The draft findings and recommendations presented include:

- a. The objective of the evaluation is to assess the overall relevance and effectiveness of the CA and to what extent the program's objectives have been achieved.
- b. The old project portfolio has limited potential for creating wider impacts.
- c. The over-arching objectives of the CA are highly relevant, and relevance has improved with the new business model.
- d. Knowledge & Learning (K&L) and Advocacy & Communications (A&C) strategies should be more clear on objectives, target groups, messages, themes, channels and means/activities (both will require in-depth analysis of target groups)
- e. K&L strategy should place the CA within the framework of K&L strategies/activities of members/partners/key actors
- f. Overall strategy should provide clear directions for selection of countries and themes for CPPs and JWPs
- g. Increase focus on attracting new funding

See Annex III for more details on the draft findings and recommendations. COWI's PowerPoint presentation is available on the CA website.

Overall, Members agreed that it was too early for another independent evaluation based on the timing of the adoption of the new Charter (November 2010) and the new business model, but recognized that the IE was needed during 2011 to meet World Bank Development Grant Facility requirements.

During the discussion, Members made comments about (1) recommendations for COWI to consider in preparing the final report; (2) the merits of the draft findings and recommendations; and (3) how the Alliance should respond to the draft recommendations.

- (1) Recommendations to COWI for the final report included:
 - a. Ensure there is clear distinction in reporting on opinions of Members, facts, and evaluator observations.
 - b. Provide evidence or examples of overlap in Knowledge Management activities between CA and members.
 - c. Group recommendations by type/categories.
 - d. Provide perspective on the implications of non-donor-organizations participating in CA governance.
 - e. The views of the clients of CA should be more clearly expressed, as well as that of regional development banks.
- (2) Comments on the merits of the draft findings and recommendations included:
 - a. Members disputed the finding that the program is not transparent.
 - b. The Members page of CA website should be reviewed to determine what should be made public.
- (3) Comments on how the Alliance should respond to the draft findings and recommendations included:

- a. A process is needed for EXCO/CG to comment on the final evaluation report and for the Secretariat and Members to respond to the findings.
- b. Identify the outcomes we want to achieve from Country Programmes and from advocacy work programmes, against which we want to be evaluated in the future.
- c. Form a working group of Members to work with the Secretariat on advocacy.
- d. Consider how to better engage European constituencies as part of efforts to increase programme funding.
- e. The evaluation report can be used to describe the shift from old to new business model.

Item 4: Report Back: Executive Committee / Cities Alliance Charter / EXCO Member Rotation

The EXCO Chair briefed Members about new dynamics and strong sense of responsibility that emerged in EXCO over the past year, which should help to facilitate CG decision-making. Reports on EXCO's March and July 2011 meetings were circulated as part of the Maputo meeting documentation, and the EXCO Chair briefed members about results from the 6 November 2011 EXCO meeting.

Cities Alliance Charter

Among business undertaken during EXCO meetings in 2011 was review of edits made to the **Cities Alliance Charter** that was approved at the November 2010 meeting of the CG in Mexico City. Subsequent to its adoption, the Legal department of World Bank proposed minor edits, mostly to clarify and be consistent in use of terms. The edited Charter was circulated to CG members on October 10, 2011, as part of the meeting documentation. EXCO had reviewed and cleared these Charter edits at its March 2011 meeting in Washington, DC, with a final review at its 6 November 2011 meeting in Maputo. EXCO requested the CG to ratify this edited Charter.

> The Consultative Group ratified the edited Charter.

Additional edits to the Charter proposed by World Bank Legal, on adoption/amendment of Charter and on decision-making, had been circulated to the EXCO/CG on November 2, 2011. EXCO recommended that more time be given to Members to consider these edits. EXCO will review these edits during 2012, for recommendation to the CG at its next meeting.

EXCO Member Rotation

Members were briefed about the expiration of terms for four EXCO members, with thanks extended for the service provided by these Members. The Members rotating off EXCO are: one representative from External Support Countries/Agencies (Germany); one from Developing Country (South Africa); and two additional representatives selected by the CG (Chile and UNEP).

- > France accepted a nomination to replace Germany.
- Shack/Slum Dwellers International and Australian Agency for International Development (pending HQ approval) accepted nominations to replace Chile and UNEP.
- Brazil was nominated to replace South Africa, but was not prepared to accept. The Secretariat will consult with the other Developing Country Members to identify an alternate candidate.

The Secretariat was asked to consider funding of travel expenses for Developing Country Member(s) to participate in EXCO meetings, to enhance participation.

Item 5: Cities Alliance Business Plan

The Secretariat Manager made opening remarks about the context and rationale of the Business Plan, its key features (including an increased focus on secondary cities), and main proposed product lines and activities. The business plan consolidates a period of repositioning of the partnership, resulting from increased clarity on program objectives resulting from a new Charter; builds upon strengths and addresses identified weaknesses; organizes activities in four main business lines; and uses annual work plans to increase accountability and impact orientation. The FY12-FY14 business plan aims to leverage the current project portfolio; support innovation and new directions through the Catalytic Fund; maximize impacts of Country Programmes; and improve communications and advocacy.

That was followed by a presentation by the World Bank on country analytic work it has been undertaking (Urbanization Reviews). The Urbanization Review provides a framework and diagnostic tools for assessing the complexity of the urbanization challenge that counties and cities face during their economic evolution, identifying policy priorities to unlock factor markets (such as land), and highlighting sectoral and spatial tradeoffs associated with investment choices. Discussion on the Urbanization Review generated heated debate, and members agreed to hold a one day retreat at some point to provide more time to discuss the work presented to the CG, given its importance CA's business model and plans. The secretariat will look far options for such a retreat

During discussion on the BP, Members expressed strong support for the work programme outlined in the plan, but clearly expressed a demand for a Results Based Management framework, including quantitative and qualitative indicators of results and outcomes. The FY12 work programme, previously approved by EXCO, was ratified by the CG.

Other Member comments on BP included:

- a. Country Programmes should bring innovative thinking and reflection. Local authorities should be involved in the design and creation of the CP, as should communities.
- b. More attention is needed to promoting governance, and space is needed for debate on the sustainable development model pursued by the CA.
- c. CA should maintain a global reach, as it is a learning alliance.
- d. The greater emphasis on gender and youth was recognized, and welcomed.
- e. Support was expressed for the more focused and thematic Catalytic Fund, and for the Baseline and Scaling Up work programmes, which should facilitate fundraising.
- f. Members requested to see more links to private sector investment and welcome increased engagement with PPIAF and GPOBA, but also cautioned not let that drive agenda away from focus of the CA.
- g. Joint work programmes, such as one proposed for MENA Region, offers potential to leverage Member resources, but should not detract CA focus from other agreed priorities.
- h. Budget of work programme should show how resources being used for CA priority focus on Africa, and budget should include both Core and Non-Core funds. More attention needed on resource mobilization.

Item 6: Cities Alliance approach for upcoming International fora

During brief opening remarks, the Secretariat asked for CG guidance on how it should approach major upcoming international events including Rio+20, COP 17, MDG Next Steps, WUF VI, and Africities.

During discussion, several Members indicated they will be participating in Rio+20, but there was consensus that the CA/Secretariat not directly participate, and instead focus during 2012 on WUF VI and Africities, which have more directly targeted audiences.

Members including HFHI, Norway and SDI will work with the Secretariat on key messages to promote during these events, and more broadly on a CA advocacy strategy.

Item 7: Catalytic Fund

The Secretariat briefed the CG on results from the first Catalytic Fund cohort. Seventy-four Concept Notes were received, covering a wide range of topics relating to environmental, social and economic aspects of urban development. After an initial screening, 45 Concept Notes were referred to the Expert Evaluation Panel for assessment and short listing. From these, the Secretariat selected seven Concept Notes, totaling \$1.6million, for invitation to submit full proposals. Currently, six full proposals have been received and two have been approved, with the others in the appraisal and approval process.

Members were also briefed on recommendations for the second Catalytic Fund cohort, scheduled for FY12, which were endorsed by EXCO at its July 2011 meeting, including the decision to add thematic criteria to increase portfolio focus. The Secretariat was asked to develop recommendations for a theme, and presented four for Member consideration:

- 1) Youth and the city: challenges of and visions for demographic change
- 2) Meeting the demand of growing cities: innovative approaches to financing urban services
- 3) Planning for green growth in secondary cities; and
- 4) Adaptive strategies for resilient communities: Local adaption strategies and disaster risk prevention in slums.

It was reported to Members that EXCO had considered these themes at its 6 November 2011 meeting, with support expressed for all four, but agreed on recommending to the CG the theme of Youth and the City.

During discussion by the CG, support was expressed for all four themes, including suggestions to pick two themes, to include all four, or to link the youth theme to the other three themes. A suggestion was also made to have a theme be covered over two or three years, so that learning from one cohort of projects can inform future cohort of projects. And support was also expressed for peer-to-peer learning among project recipients.

After discussion, the CG agreed on the theme of Youth and the City for the FY12 Catalytic Fund.

Item 8: Cities Alliance Business Matters

The Secretariat made a short presentation reviewing highlights from the FY11-FY12 Financial and Budget Report circulated to Members as part of meeting documentation, highlighting variances of FY11 actual versus budgeted results, and summarizing the FY12 Secretariat and program budget approved by EXCO at its July 2011 meeting. Core contributions remained stable in FY11, at approximately \$7.1m. Actual FY11

Secretariat expenditures were \$933,000 less than had been budgeted, due primarily to staff vacancies that were not filled during the year. The FY12 programme budget assumes \$8.0m in new contributions during the year, and \$8.2m in new funding allocations to be made, including \$2.75m for Partnership Operations and a Secretariat budget based on same staffing levels as had been budgeted for FY11.

During discussion, Members expressed the need for a funding strategy and asked for an update on resource mobilization plans.

The FY12 budgets, including the Secretariat budget, were ratified by the CG.

In a separate discussion on membership matters, the Secretariat briefed Members on the need for EXCO/CG to review membership fees/rates and focus on mobilizing new sources of funds, including renewing the membership of UK-DFID and the EU. The Secretariat will follow up with all delinquent Members about bringing their membership current. The issue of charging U.N. agencies a membership fee should also be reviewed. With the new Charter in place and business model adopted, the CA is now in better position to fundraise.

During discussion, it was suggested to investigate the European Investment Bank as a source of funding, particularly for MENA region.

Item 9: Special Session: Member Presentation

The France-based NGO, Les Ateliers, made a presentation to the CG on the participatory urban planning approach facilitated by its organization through North-South cooperation. Funded by French Ministry of Foreign Affairs, AFD and Ministry of Environment and undertaken with cities or regions in countries including Benin, Senegal and Brazil, Les Ateliers organizes international workshops on topics defined together with local authorities for city or regional planning. The methodology combines analysis, strategies and development of project plans, through a collective assessment process. The Les Ateliers methodology and network are tools to be used by cities and their partners, serving as a catalyst for long term planning. The organization expressed an interest in working with the CA and its Members. Any questions arising should be directed to the Secretariat.

Item 10: Next Governance Meetings

Based on feedback from Members and input from the Secretariat, the CG agreed that the next meeting of the Consultative Group be held in Vietnam, location of a Country Program, subject to invitation by the Government. The Secretariat would review possible dates, around November 2012.

The Secretariat also proposed that the next EXCO meeting be held in Jinja, Uganda, linking with the annual meetings of PPIAF and GPOBA as well as the CA's Uganda Country Programme on secondary cities. The meeting is scheduled for late April or early May 2012. If a second meeting of EXCO (late summer) is needed before the next CG meeting, Norway offered to host the meeting in Bergen.

> The recommendations for the next meetings were endorsed by the CG.

Consultive Group List of Participants

<u>MEMBER</u>	<u>PARTICIPANT</u>	<u>AFFILIATION</u>
AUSTRALIA	Mr. Marcus Howard Mr. Craig Gilbert	AUSAID AUSAID
BRAZIL	Ms. Maria do Carmo Avesani Mr. Kleyferson Porto de Araujo	Brazil Ministry of Cities Caixa Econômica Federal,
FRANCE	Ms. Emilie Maehara Mr. Pierre André Périssol Mr. Thierry Paulais	French Ministry of Foreign Affairs Agence Française de Développement(AfD) Agence Française de Développement(AfD)
GERMANY	Ms. Alexandra Linden	Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)
	Ms. Annette Baehring	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenaarbeit (GTZ) GmbH
HABITAT FOR	Mr. Steve Weir	Habitat for Humanity International
HIMANITY	Mr. Greg Foster	Habitat for Humanity International
INTERNATIONAL	Ms. Suannah Quist	Habitat for Humanity International
ITALY	Mr. Mariano Foti	Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs – Development Cooperation
NORWAY	Mr. Erik Berg	Royal Ministry of Foreign Affairs
SDI	Ms. Sheela Patel	SDI Secretariat
	Ms. Celine D'Cruz	SDI Secretariat
	Mr. Joel Bolnick	SDI Secretariat
SWEDEN	Mr. Mikael Atterhoeg	SIDA
UCLG	Ms. Emilia Saiz	United Cities and Local Governments
UN-HABITAT	Mr. Jan Meeuwissen	UN-Habitat
	Mr. Mathias Spaliviero	UN-Habitat
	·	
UNITED STATES	Ms. Nancy Leahy	USAgency for International Development
WORLD BANK	Ms. Zoubida Allaoua	The World Bank
	Mr. Somik Lall	The World Bank
ADVOCACY PANEL	Ms. Clare Short	Retired Member of Parliament, UK

PRESENTER

COWI Mr. Anders Richelsen COWI

OBSERVERS

FRANCE Mr. Pierre André Périssol Agence Française de Développement(AfD)

Mr. M. Nicolas Detrie Les Ateliers

PPIAF Ms. Adriana de Aguinaga de Vellutini The World Bank

UGANDA Mr. Samuel Mabala Ministry of Land, Housing and Urban

Development

Mr. Mafabi Mutwalibi Zandya Mayor of Mbale

SECRETARIAT

Ms. Chii Akporji Cities Alliance Secretariat Mr. Julian Baskin Cities Alliance Secretariat Ms. Regianne Bertolassi Cities Alliance Secretariat Mr. William Cobbett Cities Alliance Secretariat Ms. Susanna Henderson Cities Alliance Secretariat Ms. Adele Hosken Cities Alliance Secretariat Mr. Kevin Milroy Cities Alliance Secretariat Mr. Federico Silva Cities Alliance Secretariat

The Cities Alliance 2011 Consultative Group Meeting Agenda 8 November 2011

Venue: Joaquim Chissano Conference Centre, Av. Marginal nr 4441, Tel: +258 21 48 63 95/7

	DAY 1: TUESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2011			
08h00	Coffee/tea	Venue: Joaquim Chissano Conference Centre		
08h30-9h15 09h15-10h00	Introductory Statements and Welcome Co-Chairs: Zoubida Allaoua, Director, Finance, Economics and Urban Division, World Bank; Jan Meeuwissen, Acting Director, UN-Habitat Regional Office for Africa and the Arab States Manager: William Cobbett ➤ Approval of meeting report − October 2010, Mexico City Follow up from Policy Advisory Forum (PAF) Clare Short, PAF Chair; Sheela Patel, SDI	Handouts: 1) Agenda 2)Mexico City Meeting Report		
10h00 - 11h00	 ▶ Report Back from PAF Independent Evaluation 2011 Anders Richelsen, COWI A/S (Team Leader) ▶ Presentation of draft Findings & Recommendations ▶ Discussion and Next Steps 	Handouts: 6) Independent Evaluation Inception Report		
	Report Back: Executive Committee March, July, and November 2011 Meetings Emilia Saiz, UCLG Director, Institutional Relations and Acting Executive Committee Chairperson Charter: Final version EXCO Rotation	Handouts: 3) March and July Meeting Reports 4) Cities Alliance Charter 8) Partnership Matters report		
11h00-11h30	Coffee/Tea Break			
11h30-13h15	Cities Alliance Business Plan William Cobbett, Secretariat Presentation: BP Overview Discussion and Next Steps	Handouts: 5) Draft Business Plan		
	Special Session: Member Presentations Urbanization Reviews Somik Lall, Senior Economist, World Bank			

13h15-14h15	LUNCH	Venue: to be determined
14h15-14h45	Cities Alliance Business Plan continued	
	William Cobbett, Secretariat	
	Discussion and Next Steps	
	Cities Alliance approach for upcoming International	
	fora	
	UCLG and CA secretariats	
	 Discussion of CA approaches for events including Rio+20, MDG Next Steps, WUF-V, Africities 	
14h45 – 15h45	Catalytic Fund	Handouts:
	Federico Silva, Secretariat	9) Catalytic Fund report
	 Briefing from initial Catalytic Fund cohort Selection of Theme for 2012 Catalytic Fund cohort 	Handouts:
		7) Financial and Budget
	Cities Alliance Business Matters	Report, FY11-FY12
	Kevin Milroy, Secretariat	
	Financial & Budget Report	
15h45-16h15	Coffee/Tea Break	
16h15-17h15	Special Session: Member Presentations	
	Participatory Urban Planning – Nicolas Detrie, Director,	
	Les Ateliers	
17h15-17h30	Next Consultative Group Meeting	
17h30-18h00	Closing Remarks by the Co-Chairs	

Cities Alliance Independent Evaluation

Summary of Draft Findings and Recommendations

- i. Initial findings include:
 - i. The reform process starting with the adoption of the MTS has strengthened the CAs work and the organization considerably
 - ii. The overarching objectives of the CA are highly relevant.
 - iii. The CA is unique in creating an international platform, focused exclusively on urban issues
 - iv. Few undesirable overlaps between CA activities and the activities of other multiand bilateral development programmes, but knowledge activities need attention
 - v. Relevance has improved with the new business model
 - vi. Plans and objectives of the MTS and BP are being pursued. Preliminary indications of positive results but still early days
 - vii. Increasing focus on K&L after MTS but not all planned targets achieved
 - viii. Increasing attention to A&C after last evaluation/MTS, but unclear strategic intent and limited outreach beyond the CA sphere
 - ix. Need for stronger focus on A&C
 - x. Overhead costs are reasonable, but grant processing time needs to be brought down
 - xi. The programme has a high degree of legitimacy
 - xii. With the new charter, the roles and responsibilities of the different governing bodies are more clearly defined
 - xiii. Strategies for the service lines are unclear, leaving a large room to interpret what to be done (for the Sec./members)
 - xiv. The lack of an effective M&E system has been recognized as a problem for the accountability of the programme
 - xv. The programme is not very transparent for stakeholders who are not members
 - xvi. There are both pros and cons in relation to WB hosting
 - xvii. CA is vulnerable in relation to resource mobilization
- ii. Initial recommendations include:
 - xviii. Increase focus on attracting new funding
 - xix. Elaborate clear and concise strategic framework with three layers
 - xx. Overall strategy, 5-10 years
 - xxi. Medium-term strategy/business plan, 2-3 years
 - xxii. Annual work plans
 - xxiii. Incorporate strategies for each business line (incl. K&L and A&C) into this framework
 - xxiv. K&L and A&C strategies to be clear on objectives, target groups, messages, themes, channels and means/activities (both will require in-depth analysis of target groups)
 - xxv. K&L strategy should place the CA within the framework of K&L strategies/activities of members/partners/key actors
 - xxvi. Overall strategy should provide clear directions for selection of countries and themes for CPPs and JWPs

- xxvii. Review performance in relation to this framework and the four business lines (esp. CPPs) in 2-3 years
- xxviii. Develop M&E system reflecting strategic framework / intervention logics
- xxix. Think M&E system into programme documents / grant agreements for CPPs/CAT.fund projects / JWPs and the reporting requirements
- xxx. Use scoring systems/traffic lights/KPIs
- xxxi. Increase focus on impact evaluation, in particular for CPPs
- xxxii. Make the full website publicly accessible to enhance transparency
- xxxiii. Rethink the website in the perspective of K&L and A&C strategies
- xxxiv. Attract more national local government associations to enhance legitimacy and client focus