



Cities Alliance Consultative Group Meeting
16-17 November 2010
Mexico City, MEXICO
DRAFT Summary

Venue: Hilton Reforma Hotel, Mexico City, #70 Avenida Juarez

See Annex I for Final Meeting Agenda

**I. 16 November 2010: Morning Session Day 1
Policy Advisory Forum : “Thinking Strategically About Africa”**

Meeting Chair: Clare Short, Chairperson, Advocacy Panel

Following a lively three hour debate which revealed the extent and depth of existing CA members’ activities in Africa, CA members decided that the Cities Alliance should prioritize support to Sub-Saharan Africa. In this context members were of the view that it is an optimal time for the Alliance to develop a bold strategy that will allow it to play a far more active and decisive role in catalyzing action and providing support to SSA cities, and countries.

The Secretariat will circulate a draft “Cities Alliance Action plan for Africa” for comment in early 2011, which would incorporate Joint Work Programmes with members.

**II. 16 November 2010: Afternoon Session Day 1
Cities Alliance Charter Discussion and Adoption**

Co-Chairs: Inga Björk -Klevby, UN-Habitat and Zoubida Allaoua, World Bank

Item One: Report Back from July, October and November Executive Committee Meetings

Designated Chairperson, Emilia Saiz

- a. Paris July 7-8, 2010 – Hosted by UNEP**
 - i. The meeting was devoted to the Charter, following an update and assessment of the Cities Alliance
 - ii. Members received a progress report on the new business model, and
 - iii. UCLG outlined plans for the Congress in Mexico City in November
- b. Paris October 25-26, 2010 – Hosted by UNEP**

- i. This was an extraordinary meeting, which was devoted solely to discussion the draft new Charter which had been prepared and circulated by the Secretariat
- c. Mexico City, November 15, 2010**
- i. Finalised the draft Charter, for recommendation to the CG
 - ii. GHK presented its evaluation of Project Implementation Modalities of the Cities Alliance
 - iii. There was also a discussion on the process for finalising the Terms of Reference of the Independent Evaluation of 2011
 - iv. Most importantly, EXCO considered a report prepared by the Secretariat to select the fourth country programme (after Uganda, Vietnam and Ghana)
 - a. After making some additional comments on the criteria, the Executive Committee unanimously selected Burkina Faso
 - v. The next EXCO meeting will be held in Washington DC in March 2011, hosted by the World Bank
 - vi. The rest of the meeting discussed Cities Alliance business matters, all of which were part of the CG Agenda.

Item Two: Cities Alliance Charter Presentation from Executive Committee

Chairperson, Emilia Saiz, UCLG

EXCO presented the timeline of how and why the Cities Alliance undertook to review the Charter

November 2007: Manila CG – The CG considered the Medium Term Strategy (2008-2010), which was formally adopted by EXCO at its April 2008 meeting in Trondheim.

January 2009: Barcelona CG – CG created a Working Group to review how to enhance the role and ownership of cities in design and implementation of CA activities, the Governance issue, CA secretariat staffing and CA presence in Europe and later added, the focus on poor countries and secondary and tertiary cities.

September 2009: Chile EXCO – The EXCO reviewed the recommendations from the WG, took decisions on each of the 15 recommendations and circulated the report to the Working Group and the CG

January 2010: Mumbai CG – The CG mandated EXCO to review the Charter in 2 phases a.) Membership and Governance, and b.) a review of the entire Charter, following the 2011 independent evaluation.

July 2010: Paris EXCO – agreed to amend the Charter in-house and realized that because of the integrated nature of the document, it needed to expand the review to include the Chapeau, Objectives and rationale, sections B, C and D, “Relationships with Programmes of Participating Partners”, “Cities Alliance Activities”, and “Activity Identification and Selection”, respectively, and Section E “Governance and Organisational Structure”.

EXCO members agreed to follow this method, which would need to be explained to the CG at the Mexico City Meeting, and the endorsement for the approach condoned.

- a. EXCO moved beyond the original terms of reference, and was also not able to circulate the draft Charter within the normal timeframes.

October 2010: Paris EXCO – At this meeting, the Secretariat presented EXCO with two options: (i) to continue trying to amend and improve the existing Charter or (ii) to consider a wholly new draft Charter, which had been prepared by the Secretariat. After a short discussion, EXCO decided to focus its attention on the new draft. The Secretariat tabled a new, draft Charter for consideration. During the course of the extra-ordinary October meeting, EXCO made significant progress, largely completing the new draft Charter for submission to the CG. It was this version (26 October 2010) that was circulated subsequently to the CG, with provisions made for comments to be accepted until 3 November 2010.

November 2010: Mexico City EXCO - met briefly prior to the CG Meeting, to consider additional comments from Norway and Germany, as well as some preliminary comments from the World Bank lawyer and detailed procedural and substantive comments received by email from Sida. As requested by Sweden, these comments were circulated to all CG members.

Prior to tabling the Charter for discussion, the Chair of EXCO explained the decision to deviate from the original CG mandated, and to consider and table a new Charter. CG members were formally requested to sanction the EXCO approach.

After considering all comments, both written and verbal, the CG unanimously:

1. Endorsed the process undertaken by the Executive Committee to draft a new Charter
2. Agreed to consider the new version of the Charter, as circulated on 26 October 2010, and as amended on 15 November 2010

The CG dedicated the afternoon session to reviewing the version of the Charter submitted by the EXCO on 15 November, line by line. The new Charter was then unanimously adopted and acclaimed, subject to final review and clearance by the World Bank lawyers upon the Secretariat's return to Washington.

III. 17 November 2010 Morning Session Day 2

Item One: Partnership Matters

Following the CG meeting of 16th November and the adoption of the Charter, the EXCO met to make the following two recommendations to the CG:

1. That Clare Short be invited to serve as the first Chairperson of the Policy Advisory Forum, for a period of three calendar years (2011-2013); and
2. That the CG consider ratifying the composition of the five rotating members, for purposes of continuity, according to the following formula:
 - a. Two representatives from external support countries/agencies: Germany and Norway
 - b. One developing country representative: Chile
 - c. Two other members: South Africa and UNEP

The CG unanimously endorsed both recommendations from the EXCO.

Item Two: Presentation of Project Implementation Modalities of the Cities Alliance: Findings and Signposts

1. This evaluation which was undertaken by GHK International, had evaluated client and non-client grant implementation for city development and slum upgrading projects in cities or at national level.
2. Key Outcomes included –
 - a. High transaction cost of grant administration
 - b. Member involvement is key to the quality during grant execution phase
 - c. There is limited capturing and sharing of results and lessons
 - d. Timely delivery is important to realise results & catalytic effects
 - e. CA has a good reputation with ability to use it as leverage
3. Final report due in December 2010
 - a. The Secretariat will review all the recommendations from GHK and prepare a matrix with action steps to present to the EXCO at its next meeting
 - b. The Secretariat will work with the World Bank Finance Economic and Urban Development Department Director's Office to review which policies identify areas where improvements are possible
 - c. The Secretariat will provide a status report at the next EXCO meeting to be held at the World Bank's offices in Washington, DC.

Item Three: Update on Results Based Management and Discussion of the Terms of Reference, Independent Evaluation 2011

Update on Results Based Management (RMB) for the new Cities Alliance Business Model

CA's approach to Results- Based Management:

- a. **Sharpens the CA focus** by building on CA's comparative advantages,
- b. Further **operationalize the new business model** and helps to **prioritize activities**, and
- c. Helps to coherently **explain** how CA works and what it achieves.

Cities Alliance' objectives

- a. To strengthen and promote the role of **cities in poverty reduction**, and in sustainable development;
- b. To capture and strengthen the **synergies** between members and partners; and
- c. To improve the **quality of urban development cooperation** and lending.

Discussion of the Terms of Reference, Independent Evaluation 2011

The Cities Alliance is will be the subject of an independent evaluation in 2011.

- a. As agreed at the meeting, the Secretariat will re-circulate the draft Terms of Reference, as well as the Guidelines for Evaluation applying to the Development Grant Facility (DGF – World Bank Cities Alliance contribution)

- b. Comments received by the Secretariat by 23 December 2010 deadline were subsequently incorporated into the terms of reference.

Item Four: Presentation: Cities Alliance Business Matters

Review of Budget and Work Programme FY10-11

- a. CA has allocated \$16m in FY10, \$10.7million from Core Funds, of which, \$9.5m are for country-specific projects
- b. Prior to closing the Grant Facility on 31 March 2010, the CA received 29 proposals, totaling \$9.3m, of which 24 passed threshold; 9 have been approved in FY10 and 15 will carry over to FY11
- c. Heavy demand for CA grant facility during the close-down period depleted the \$6.7m unallocated CA Core Funds carried into the start of FY10.
- d. Core Contributions from donors totaled \$7.1million, the same as the FY09 level. However, investment income was down due to low yields.
- e. Actual expenditures for FY10 Secretariat costs are expected to be approximately \$0.2m less than was budgeted due to delays in hiring staff
- f. For FY11, \$19.15m budget to support the work programme was endorsed by the EXCO at its July 2010 meeting - \$10.15m from Core, \$8m from unallocated Gates funds, and \$1m from the Africa Facility
- g. To fully implement the work programme, an increase of \$2.5m in Core funds is needed for FY11
 - i. Under approved allocations, UN-Habitat requested the Secretariat to review State of the Cities Reports, to reduce duplication of effort

Forward Planning and Resource Mobilisation

- a. As the Secretariat implements the new business model, in particular the Country Programmes, it will need active support from members in fundraising for the CA.
- b. The Secretariat will incorporate fundraising into a new business plan for the organisation.
- c. The Secretariat is designing products that will take on board recommendations from the GHK evaluation

Item Five: Presentation and Discussion: Catalytic Fund and Small Grant Facility

(Circulated to members in the Red Book and the Blue Book)

Catalytic Fund -Objectives

- a. Aims to have catalytic effects on initiating and enhancing urban transformation processes, and in promoting more inclusive cities.
- b. Aims at advancing collective know-how through the learning that can be distilled from the project experiences and shared among CA partners, CA members and beyond.

Catalytic Fund -Key Characteristics

- a. Competitive process

- b. Open twice a year
- c. Two step process (Concept Note and Full Application)
- d. Support by an expert evaluation panel (EEP)
- e. The grant size limited to US\$50,000-US\$250,000. Total Budget US\$2,000,000 (FY11)
- f. CA Sponsorship required

Timeline and how to apply

1stCall: Open from January to end of February 2011 -> Selection by June 2011

2ndCall: Open from August to end of September 2011 -> Selection by January 2012

The Small Grant Facility

- a. Same CATF objectives
- b. Open all year round for submission
- c. Quarterly competitive selection
- d. Support to CA members
- e. Grant size limited to US\$50,000, total budget US\$400,000 (FY11).
- f. Simplified process (Concept note, Internal screening, 1 year implementation)

Members were requested to send comments on both Facilities to the Secretariat by 23 December 2010. The Secretariat subsequently received additional remarks from members, which were incorporated.

IV. 17 November 2010 Afternoon Session Day 2

The afternoon session was devoted to presentations by the Secretariat highlighting progress in the implementation of the Work Programme. For the purposes of brevity, these are presented in an abbreviated form below:

Item Six: Presentation: Country Programmes

Principles of the Country Programmes:

- a. Coherence of effort, particularly amongst its members
- b. Long-term, pro-poor urban programming
- c. Multi-sectoral and aligned approach
- d. Demand-oriented programme design process
- e. Building long-term institutional capacities
- f. Engaging for systemic change and impacts at scale

Updates provided on the ongoing Country Programmes including:

Uganda, Ghana and Vietnam

Lessons from Country Programmes thus far

- a. Country Programmes require significant input, and investment
- b. Partnerships between members and other stakeholders are essential
- c. Country Programmes can be effective in creating space for informed policy dialogue
- d. Country Programmes have excellent potential for attracting new partners

Way Forward

- a. The Country Programme team will also be reviewing existing CA portfolio in countries such as Mozambique and Malawi
- b. The development of a Burkina Faso Country Programme will commence in early 2011, and will achieve member participation
- c. Particular attention needs to be paid to the benefits of involving middle-income developing countries

Item Seven: Presentations: Knowledge and Communication

Three presentations were made by the Secretariat to update the members on what the Secretariat has achieved this year in the areas of:

1.) Knowledge and the Environment

- a. The CA has transitioned to a Knowledge and Learning Programme, moving from a dispersed range of knowledge activities to programmatic knowledge generation and learning.
- b. The goal of the programme is to improve the collective know-how of the Alliance members while making it available and facilitating the knowledge adoption by the Alliance partners (e.g. local and national authorities, citizens, etc.)
- c. Matching knowledge needs and sources, responding to knowledge gaps by supporting collective learning and convergence of thinking for coherent actions.

Work Programmes on Environment

- a. Joint Work Programme on Cities and Climate Change with UNEP, UN-Habitat and the WB
- b. Joint Programme with the World Bank to understand the linkages between Climate Change, Disaster Risk and the Urban Poor
- c. Joint Programme with UNEP on fully integrating the environmental dimension into CDSs and SUs, (and the urban dimension into UNEPs work programme)
- d. Joint Programme with the World Bank to support the ECO2Cities, in particular training and dissemination

Proposed priorities

- a. Continuation of JWP on cities and climate change
- b. Continuation of integrating the broader Environment into CA activities
- c. Continue mainstreaming Gender and Youth in CA activities
- d. Establishment of a State of Cities Reports learning group initially with the Secretariat
- e. Starting a Joint Work Programme on incremental urbanization in Africa
- f. Consolidate the CDS working group, and improve focus on environment and gender

2.) Gender and Youth

Objective

Mainstream Gender and Youth in Cities Alliance supported operations because:

- 1.) There is enormous untapped potential of women and youth as drivers of urban development, and

2.) All projects have an impact on gender relations

How to Mainstream Gender and Youth

Country Programme Mainstreaming:

- a. Gender Analysis as part of Country Programme design
- b. A focus on women in community mobilizing
- c. Feedback on each Country Framework from the UN Habitat Youth Advisory Board
- d. Cooperation with UN Habitat's Opportunities Fund for Youth Led Development in the identified Country Programmes
- e. Gender and age sensitive proposal criteria
- f. Gender and age responsive Monitoring and Evaluation

Catalytic Project Mainstreaming:

- a. Gender and age responsive proposal criteria
- b. Gender and age responsive Monitoring and Evaluation
- c. Potential knowledge products on Gender and Youth

Knowledge and Learning Mainstreaming:

- a. Thematic areas in CDS sub group clearing house
- b. Informal Gender and Urban Development working group at the World Bank (2012 WDR)
- c. Case action study on addressing Youth and Employment in

Communication and Advocacy Mainstreaming:

- a. Staff workshop on Gender and Urban Development
- b. Gender and youth focal point to be institutionalised in Cities Alliance
- c. Section on Gender and Slum Upgrading included on the CA webpage and highlighted in the Annual Report 2009
- d. CIVIS note on Gender in planning
- e. Feature story on 'Empowering Youth is Essential for developing Inclusive Cities'
- f. CIVIS note on Youth in planning

Recommendations

- a. Monitor mainstreaming of Gender and Youth
- b. Continue having a gender and youth focal point within the secretariat staff
- c. Increased focus on knowledge products on Gender and Youth
- d. Promoting gender and youth in urban development through communication and advocacy

3.) Communications and Advocacy

To propose a framework for supporting CA's new work programme pillars: Catalytic Fund; Country Programmes; a more systematized knowledge and Learning programme

Mainstreaming C & A into the Catalytic Fund activities

- a. Designing a C& A mechanism to be incorporated in the proposal request forms -as part of overall proposal approval and implementation process
- b. Role in formal Launch of the Fund -Creating the awareness --the What, How, and Why of the Fund -Approval , Evaluation Processes, Timelines
- c. Supporting Knowledge and Learning from Cat Fund activities –distillation, packaging and dissemination through agreed relevant channels –publications, discussion fora, blogs, south-south exchanges, events participation

Mainstreaming C & A into Country Programmes

- a. Undertake the necessary backgrounder study needs analysis for selected country programme country -socio-political context, reputational risk factors, attitudes, target audience and what needs to be changed –in partnership with local players; overtime, develop a tool for this analysis
- b. With local partners design and implement country specific behavior change communications/advocacy strategy -this partnership is important as activities and messages at the local level will feed into overall CA corporate messaging
- c. Capture and promote key milestones from in-country activity –policy reforms, scaling up.
- d. Capture knowledge and lessons learned for formatting and dissemination -Country Case studies; Impact Stories –of the Urban Poor, Gender and Youth

Mainstreaming C & A into Knowledge and Learning

- a. Classification and tagging of knowledge resources -from activities funded by the Old Grant Facility and from Cat fund and Country programme activities
- b. Project profiles based on knowledge from activities of Old Grant Facility -publish lessons learned and stories of impact
- c. Promote and publish significant of outcomes of Joint Work Programmes(JWPs)
- d. Promote publication of State of the Cities Reports
- e. Populate a CA Knowledge Resources database -promote and monitor uptake
- f. Help with organisation of public policy forums, workshops, south-south policy dialogues seminars to share knowledge

Item Eight: Next Consultative Group Meeting

On behalf of the Cities Alliance, Italy has agreed to approach the Government of Mozambique to explore interest in hosting the next CG meeting.

ANNEX I

**The Cities Alliance
2010 Consultative Group Meeting
Agenda
16-17 November 2010**

**Venue: Hilton Hotel Reforma
Avenida Juarez #70, Mexico City, Mexico 06010, Tel: 52-55-5130-5300**

DAY 1: TUESDAY, 16 NOVEMBER 2010		
9h30–10h00	<i>Coffee/Tea</i>	<i>Venue: Don Alberto One</i>
10h00-13h00	Member Policy Discussion: “Thinking Strategically About Africa” <i>Facilitator: Clare Short, Policy Advisory Forum Chair</i>	
3h00-14h30	<i>Lunch</i>	<i>Venue: Hilton Hotel Reforma</i>
14h30-15h30	Introductory Statements & Welcome <i>Co-Chairs: Inga Björk-Klevby, UN-Habitat Deputy Executive Director & Zoubida Allaoua, Director, Finance, Economics and Urban Division, Manager: William Cobbett</i> Report Back: Executive Committee July, October and November 2010 Meetings <i>Elisabeth Gateau, UCLG Secretary General and Executive Committee Chairperson</i>	<i>Handouts: Medium Term Strategy Update (October 2010)</i>
15h30-16h00	<i>Coffee/Tea Break</i>	
16h00-18h30	Presentation: Cities Alliance Charter <i>Executive Committee</i> Member Charter Discussion	<i>Handouts: Current Charter, Draft Charter 26 October 2010 version</i>
18h30	Summary of discussions <i>Co-Chairs: Inga Björk-Klevby, UN-Habitat Deputy Executive Director & Zoubida Allaoua, World Bank, Director, Finance, Economics and Urban Division</i>	
19h00	Member Cocktail Reception	<i>Venue: Doña Sol</i>
DAY 2: WEDNESDAY, 17 November 2010		

08h30	<i>Coffee/Tea</i>	<i>Venue: Don Alberto One</i>
09h00-09h30	Partnership Matter ➤ <i>New Executive Committee Member Election</i>	<i>Handouts: Partnership Matter</i>
09h30-10h30	Presentation: Evaluation of Project Implementation Modalities of the Cities Alliance: Findings and Signposts <i>Jamie Simpson, GHK International, Director</i> Member Discussion/Q&A	<i>Handouts: GHK International ppt</i>
10h30-11h00	<i>Coffee/Tea Break</i>	
11h00-11h30	Update on Results Based Management and Discussion of the Terms of Reference, Independent Evaluation 2011 <i>Gunter Meinert, Secretariat</i>	<i>Handouts: CA Evaluation Briefing Note</i>
11h30-12h00	Presentation: Cities Alliance Business Matters <i>Kevin Milroy and Phyllis Kibui, Secretariat</i> ➤ <i>Budget and Work Programme FY10-FY11</i> ➤ <i>Forward Planning and Resource Mobilisation</i>	<i>Handouts: Work Programme and Financial Plan, Portfolio Review FY00-FY10</i>
12h00-12h45	Presentation and Discussion: Catalytic Fund <i>Federico Silva and Gunter Meinert Secretariat</i> Member Discussion/Q&A	<i>Handouts: Catalytic Fund and Small Grant Facility</i>
12h45-15h30	<i>Lunch with the UCLG Executive Bureau Members</i>	<i>Venue: Casino Español</i>
15h30-16h15	Presentation: Country Programmes <i>Julian Baskin and Andrea Zeman, Secretariat</i> Member Discussion/Q&A ➤ <i>Germany Presentation of “Back-Up Initiative”</i> <i>Franz Marre, BMZ</i>	<i>Handouts: Back-Up Initiative</i>
16h15-17h00	Presentation: Knowledge and Communication <i>Ricardo Jimenez, Hilde Refstie, Chii Akporji, Gunter Meinert, Secretariat</i> Member Discussion/Q&A	
17h00-17h15	Next Consultative Group Meeting	

17h15-17h30	Closing Remarks by the Co-Chairs Inga Björk-Klevby & Zoubida Allaoua	
<i>UCLG Hosted Evening Events</i>		
19h00-20h00	<i>Inauguration and Tour of the World Congress Exposition</i>	<i>Venue: Calle Dr. Mora, Alameda Central</i>
20h30-22h00	<i>World Congress Welcome Reception</i>	<i>Venue: Palacio del Ayuntamiento, Zócalo de la Cidade de México</i>