

Cities Alliance

Cities Without Slums

Cities Alliance Executive Committee Meeting
10-11 March 2011
Washington, DC
Summary

Key Decisions and/or Follow-up Actions:

1.) The World Bank's Urban Strategy for Africa Presentation (Joint Work Programme (JWP))

- a. The initial funding for the AFTUW JWP (USD 500,000) was approved by the CG during its meeting in the Mexico City, and the full proposal has been circulated to the Cities Alliance Consultative Group for Donor Coordination with member comments due back to the Secretariat on 18 March. Final comments from members will be compiled and shared with AFTUW and the Alliance can expect a final version of the programme to be circulated by the end of March 2011.
- b. Cities Alliance Strategy for Africa will be incorporated into the draft Business Plan

2.) Update on Cities Alliance Grant Making

- a. The Secretariat was requested by the members of the EXCO to keep working with the World Bank to improve the time it takes to process Grant Agreements and disburse funds to recipients.
- b. It was further agreed that possibilities would be explored to enable a two-tier system by which Cities Alliance would be able to simplify processes for smaller grants, but also for atypical and experimental/innovation driven experiences that would not usually fit in the strategies of the individual partners.
- c. Grant Facility will be incorporated in the draft Business Plan

3.) Lessons and Recommendations from the GHK Evaluation of Project Implementation

Modalities

- a. The Secretariat will develop an annotated outline of the Business Plan for the next EXCO meeting (July 2011), along with the proposed FY12 work programme and budget in the outcome-oriented format proposed for the Plan.

4.) Implementation of New Business model

- a. **Knowledge** - The Secretariat was tasked with following up with individual members to find out what they would like to see generated from CA's knowledge and learning programme. The Secretariat will present initial proposals to EXCO in July, related to the (draft) business plan.
- b. **Country Programme Update** –
 - i. Based on the number of existing Cities Alliance grants, the next two potential country programmes are Malawi and Mozambique. The Secretariat is undertaking a portfolio review of each country and hopes to make a recommendation at the next EXCO meeting.
 - ii. EXCO requested more advanced information on the Country Programmes, which are new to the members and the nuances of each programme are difficult to immediately grasp. The Secretariat was requested to produce

advanced information on the programmes as well as a progress report including the framework – what was agreed, what has been achieved, and the budget for each programme

5.) Charter Update

- a. The EXCO asked the Legal Counsel team to draft the necessary legal language where required, and the Secretariat will circulate the final version of the Charter to the CG shortly.

6.) Independent Evaluation 2011 Update

- a. The EXCO decided to ask for three full proposals from Universalialia, COWI and DEGE.

7.) Membership Issues

- a. The Chair of the EXCO will write a letter to each member organisation in arrears, highlighting the importance of this matter.

8.) Next EXCO Meeting and Consultative Group Meeting

- a. The next EXCO meeting will either be held in Ghana or Germany, 11-12 July 2011
- b. The next CG is on track to be held in Maputo, most likely early December 2011

I. Attendance

Executive Committee: Messrs. Carrasco (Chile); Marré (BMZ), Baehring (GIZ) (Germany); Berg (Norway); Maphisa (South Africa); Anthony (Chair), Gateau (former Chair) and Saiz (UCLG); Smaoun (UNEP); Biau (UN-Habitat); Allaoua (World Bank); Short (PAF); Cobbett (Secretariat)

Policy Advisory Forum: Ms. Clare Short

Presenters: Messrs. Simpson (GHK International); Ahmad Kamal, Joshi-Ghani, Kruse-Tietz, Stumpf (World Bank);

Observers: Messrs. Hewson (UN-Habitat); Kirby-Zaki and Ortiz (World Bank)

Secretariat: Messrs. Baskin, Henderson, Kibui, Meinert and Milroy

Venue: World Bank Headquarters, 1818 H Street, NW, Washington, DC

See Annex I for Final Meeting Agenda

DAY 1: 10 March 2011

II. Morning Session: Book Launch, “Triumph of the City: How Our Greatest Invention Makes Us Richer, Smarter, Greener, Healthier, and Happier” by Edward Glaeser

Excerpt: “[Triumph of the City](#)” (Google Books)

“A pioneering urban economist, Mr. Glaeser offers fascinating, even inspiring proof that the city is humanity's greatest invention and our best hope for the future.”

The Executive Committee members were special guests at the launch of Edward Glaeser’s new book, which was hosted at the World Bank and sponsored by the InfoShop, the Global Urbanisation Knowledge Platform, the Metropolitan Policy Program at Brookings, and the Urban and Local Government Unit of the World Bank.

III. Afternoon Session

Meeting Chair: Clarence Anthony

1. Opening and Welcome

Clarence Anthony, Interim EXCO Chair and Interim Secretary -General of UCLG, opened the meeting, welcomed all members and in particular asked Elisabeth Gateau, former EXCO Chair and former Secretary-General of UCLG, to say a few words.

Elisabeth thanked the World Bank for hosting the meeting, welcomed Clarence and the other members, and gave a brief history of UCLG. She stated that the objective of UCLG – to achieve recognition of local governments at an international level – has made progress but there is more work to do. She stressed that the role of local governments should be recognised, and that they should be seen as partners. **She indicated that the best partnership for UCLG is Cities Alliance, as it is the only place where UCLG has the space for partnership recognition. UCLG expressed continued support for Cities Alliance and the policy of client execution. Elisabeth thanked the Cities Alliance members and encouraged the group to make the partnership bigger and stronger.**

The World Bank, as host of the meetings, welcomed the EXCO to Washington and indicated that the Cities Alliance can count on World Bank support. The World Bank noted that it has launched an urban strategy that is reshaping the dialogue within the Bank and is in the process of launching an Urbanisation Knowledge Platform that will raise the profile of Urban Development within the Bank. **The Bank supports a frank exchange of ideas to make grant disbursement more effective.** A number of different World Bank unit representatives attended the meeting.

2. Strategic Priorities for the Cities Alliance Partnership

a. Introduction, William Cobbett, Secretariat Manager

As a result of the wish expressed by members to focus on LDCs and the CG decision in Mexico City (November 2010) to focus on Africa, **the Secretariat proposed to take the period between now and the next CG meeting in Maputo in November/December 2011 to engage with CA members to forge a common, transformative work programme around Sub-Saharan Africa.**

The Secretariat aims to:

1. Build upon CA members' existing SSA portfolios
2. Identify geographical or thematic gaps in SSA
3. Build up agreement where the CA could add value

The Africa-focused Work Programme would not only be used to guide the Secretariat's – and thus the Cities Alliance's – work for the year, but also be used as a vehicle for partnership, to leverage and maximise the benefits of the Cities Alliance's location at the World Bank, and to increase the impact that Cities Alliance and its members can have in supporting the urban transition in Sub-Saharan Africa. The Africa-focused Work Programme explicitly includes and builds upon the lessons and experience of members and partners in MIC countries.

A. The World Bank's Urban Strategy for Africa Presentation (Joint Work Programme (JWP))

a. Presentation, Junaid Ahmad Kamal, Sector Manager, Africa Urban and Water Unit (AFTUW)

The World Bank has taken the first step to engage programmatically with the Cities Alliance in Africa through the creation of a Joint Work Programme. The Africa Region of the Bank has indicated its intention to move away from *ad hoc* projects and to embrace a national system of cities approach in order to empower cities and towns as centres of governance, in order for them to be able to manage the urbanization process. The Bank is looking to invest in the capacities in cities and towns and link the leadership of cities to their citizens.

This fiscal year, the World Bank has budgeted USD700million in urban investments, and USD 1.8 billion in Fiscal Year 12. The Bank's administrative budget for Urban in Africa is USD 7 million and will be increased to USD 10 million next fiscal year.

The Joint Work Programme is an invitation to the Cities Alliance to partner with the Bank programmatically and use its resources in a demand-driven way for policy advocacy, city-to-city

exchanges, and operational support. The Cities Alliance partnership will also enable AFTUW and the Urban and Local Government Anchor to continue to push the urban agenda within the Bank.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

EXCO members and the Chair of the PAF welcomed the Bank's Africa Urban programme. They indicated that it is a powerful programme, and appreciated the opportunity to provide face-to-face input with respect to the programme's efficacy. Individually, UN-Habitat, UNEP, and UCLG expressed a desire to contribute to the strategy and noted the importance of building on existing initiatives, in particular the city networks and local government national and regional associations active in Africa.

In regards to the Alliance, members were interested to know how this JWP would build upon the existing CA Country Programmes in Uganda, Ghana and Burkina Faso, which are strongly supported. The EXCO also expressed support for the country programmes of the Alliance.

UCLG further stressed the need to involve its African Section, UCLGA, in this programme.

The World Bank indicated that its Africa Urban development and local government strategy is a regional, demand-driven programme, not only from National Governments, but also from city governments, which – it was noted – are beginning to influence the urban debate. Investments in select countries such as South Africa (requested USD 300,000 of CA funding) will spread to the entire region. **The World Bank supported the idea expressed by the Chair of the PAF that the Cities Alliance's Country Programmes could be leveraged by the World Bank and other members.** The Bank indicated that it would not "swallow" CA Country Programmes and emphasised the need for ongoing coordination between the CA and the World Bank. It was stated that due to the ongoing streamlining of Global Programmes and Trust Funds within the Bank, it has been difficult to transfer funds to the clients of CA's Country Programmes because small grants and multi-million dollar World Bank loans must follow the same procedures. AFTUW noted that they too are frustrated with current Bank procedures and encouraged Cities Alliance members to raise the issue with their Ministers of Finance and through the G7 Development committee.

The initial funding for the AFTUW JWP (USD 500,000) was approved by the CG during its meeting in the Mexico City, and the full proposal has been circulated to the Cities Alliance Consultative Group for Donor Coordination with member comments due back to the Secretariat on 18 March. Final comments from members will be compiled and shared with AFTUW and the Alliance can expect a final version of the programme to be circulated by the end of March 2011.

B. The World Bank's Urbanisation Knowledge Platform

a. Presentation, Abha Joshi-Ghani, Manager, Urban and Local Government Unit

The World Bank wants to democratise its knowledge and has decided to fund three multi-year knowledge platforms. In January 2011, Urbanisation was selected as one of these platforms, to put Urbanisation on the World Bank's agenda and also raise the profile of Urban Development in developing countries.

The Bank envisions the platform – based around the pillars of economics, social, environment and governance – as a significant resource for people discussing and learning about urban. It would like policy makers and practitioners, researchers, the private sector and knowledge brokers to take the

lead and drive the platform, which will consist of online open forums, knowledge exchanges, thought leaders and a data platform.

The World Bank will provide the initial funding, the venue, some of the content and the facilitation, and **is seeking to involve key urban players such as the Cities Alliance**, the Brookings Institute, the Kennedy School of Business, as well as European, Asian and African partners to bring critical mass to the platform. The aim is to make the platform an independent, self-sustaining, regional tool, which will convene, connect, customise and create knowledge.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

EXCO members were interested in the presentation and wanted to know the relationship of the Knowledge Platform to the Cities Alliance. The Secretariat pointed out that members could determine their own relationship with the platform. Some EXCO members noted that there are many such platforms and wanted to know if there was an expressed need for this platform. It was also pointed out that two to three years is a very short time frame for the establishment of the platform. However, UNEP and Norway expressed support for the platform; UCLG reiterated its willingness to contribute, ensuring that the opinion of local leaders is also featured as a part of the platform; and the Secretariat noted that the World Urban Campaign, the World Urban Forum and many other member initiatives could and should be linked to the platform. **The Bank indicated that the platform is looking to engage with partners to bring the urban debate to the international stage and would greatly welcome Cities Alliance support and involvement.**

C. Presentation: Update on Cities Alliance Grant Making

- a. Phyllis Kibui, Secretariat with Lydia Kruse Tietz, Trust Fund Coordinator and Senior Resource Management Officer, Sustainable Development Network (SDN), World Bank**

At the EXCO meeting in Mexico City, November 2010, the Secretariat presented the “Project Approval and Grant Set-up Processing Time Statistical Summary FY2007-2010” and indicated that while it had built its capacity to improve efficiencies in the grant set-up process, Members should anticipate possible delays due to streamlining and tightening of grant set-up procedures within the World Bank.

The Secretariat presented to the EXCO the “Proposal Approval and Grant Set-Up Processing Time Statistical Summary Fiscal Years 2010 – 2011” and indeed, **the grant processing time has slowed considerably due to a range of factors including re-enforcement of World Bank policies and procedures such as the requirement for Country Director concurrence for each country-specific activity, having the Country Director as the Bank signatory for Grant Agreements (GAs) supporting country-specific activities, the introduction of new World Bank procedures for Safeguards screenings on all grants of all sizes, and the additional review of Grant Agreements by country legal team, etc.** The Secretariat continues to work with the Front Office of the Sustainable Development Network (SDN), the Vice Presidency in which the programme is located, to manage and mitigate the impact of these procedures. **The current delays apply mainly to the proposals processed under the Old Grant Facility and to the processing of new grants for active projects for which the funding had been phased out. The Secretariat anticipates that some of these delays will**

be mitigated in the future, as many of the new requirements have been built in to the procedures for the Catalytic Fund. In addition, it is expected that some of the efficiencies will be gained in regards to Country Programmes as the Secretariat works upstream with the Bank Country Teams to obtain the necessary clearances.

The Trust Fund Coordinator for SDN explained the growth and impact of Trust Funds on the Bank's business. Trust Funds now account for 50% of Technical Assistance and Knowledge work.

In 2007, the Bank introduced a policy framework to regularise its management of Trust Funds. Many of the policies have been in place, but not consistently applied, which is now occurring. However, effective communication and upstream management can prevent unnecessary issues arising.

The Independent Evaluation Group (IEG) of the World Bank has issued a report on Trust Funds and Global Partnership Programmes (GPPs) in which the CA was well received. In the report, Cities Alliance is highlighted as a "recognised leader" in its field, and one of the more successful programmes "in achieving their outputs and outcomes." A comprehensive review of GPPs within SDN is underway.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

EXCO Members were highly appreciative of the candour with which the information was presented by both the Secretariat and the World Bank. Members agreed that there is no way to resolve these issues today, but indicated that steps must be taken to remedy the situation. Members were very keen for the Secretariat to explore possible alternatives to speed up fund disbursement. **The Secretariat was requested by the members of the EXCO to keep working with the World Bank to improve the time it takes to process Grant Agreements and disburse funds to recipients. It was further agreed that possibilities would be explored to enable a two-tier system by which Cities Alliance would be able to simplify processes for smaller grants, but also for atypical and experimental/innovation driven experiences that would not usually fit in the strategies of the individual partners.**

DAY 2: 11 March 2011

IV. Morning Session

Meeting Chair: Clarence Anthony

1. Summary of 10 March Discussions

The Chair reflected on the major issues that had been addressed by EXCO on the first day of the meeting. He began by thanking the Cities Alliance members for the recognition that they had bestowed on Elisabeth Gateau, who had recently vacated her post as Secretary General of UCLG, and had played such a consistent and influential role in the success of the Cities Alliance.

The Chairperson noted that members had welcomed the new partnership with the World Bank in general, and the Africa Region in particular. The programme that had been presented was bold and innovative, and was consistent with the new business model of the Cities Alliance.

The Chair highlighted the importance of the discussion about the constraints being faced by the Cities Alliance (and others) in the new environment for the management of small grants at the World Bank. He emphasised the concern that had been expressed by all Cities Alliance members, and their willingness to consider a range of options and alternatives, should the problem not be adequately addressed. The Chair thanked the Secretariat and the various World Bank units for the useful facts, and constructive responses, that had helped facilitate this important discussion.

2. Cities Alliance as an Effective Partnership

a. Introduction, William Cobbett, Secretariat Manager

The Secretariat believes that there are very clear signs that Urbanisation and the role of cities are being positively recognised and moving up in importance on the development agenda as well as in the academic world.

The CA is primed to move forward as an effective partnership. Since the last independent evaluation of the Cities Alliance in 2006, the Alliance has drafted and adopted a Medium Term Strategy (MTS) (2008-2010) and updated the MTS to reflect the shift towards its programmatic, systemic approach. In parallel, the CG established a Working Group which raised longer term questions about the CA, and this culminated in the adoption of a new Charter which captures CA's unique aspect of being focused on cities and partnership (November 2010).

Cities Alliance now has three clear objectives, (i) To strengthen and promote the role of cities in poverty reduction, and in sustainable development; (ii) To capture and strengthen the synergies between and among members and partners; and (iii) To improve the quality of urban development cooperation and lending. We have a clear results framework and theory of change based on inclusive cities, a revised business model and a mix of products to offer. CA has a large active portfolio of activities, and the Secretariat is committed to mining and disseminating the knowledge and lessons from these activities.

The CA has closed the open-access grant facility (USD 8 million in funding applications processed in final batch of proposals); opened a competitive Catalytic Fund window; and introduced the initial

country programmes through the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation funding of the “Land, Service and Citizenship (LSC) Programmes” in Uganda, Ghana and Vietnam. Work is beginning in Burkina Faso, the fourth LSC country, selected by the EXCO in Mexico City. The Secretariat has been restructured, and its Grant Administration capacity has been strengthened to deal with the current fluid situation within the World Bank.

As part of the movement to make the partnership more effective, GHK International was commissioned to evaluate CA’s project implementation modalities. GHK will present its final findings and recommendations, and the Secretariat will respond.

1. Presentation: Lessons and Recommendations from the GHK Evaluation of Project Implementation Modalities and Responses from the Secretariat

a. Jamie Simpson, GHK International, Director and Kevin Milroy, Sr. Operations Officer/Deputy Programme Manager, Secretariat

Objective: “The evaluation of client and of non-client grant implementation for city development and slum upgrading projects in cities or at national level should provide evidence to assess the applicability and effects of [client and member] implementation modalities.”

The evaluation also provided guidance to the Alliance on improving ownership, ease of administration and the quality of projects as well as provided a link to the feasibility of the emerging strategy and new business model.

General Findings

1) Client vs. Member Grant Execution

- i) No necessary link between mode of execution and strength of client ownership
- ii) Members play an important role in either mode especially in terms of project quality
- iii) Partnerships and flexibility are the key

2) Coherence of Effort

- i) Where there is coherence of effort – from Application to Execution - CA value added is likely to be enhanced – this needs to be strengthened as not systematic

3) Quality of Projects / Knowledge Leverage is a Key

- i) CA support, via client or member execution, contributes to better evidence on urban poverty and more participatory pro-poor planning approaches
- ii) CA provides valuable inputs in terms of approaches and techniques and knowledge sharing

4) National and Local Levels are both Necessary

- i) Alignment among national, regional & local levels a key success factor that requires greater attention

5) From Findings to Recommendations

- i) Designed to strengthen value added and enhancing CA reputational leverage
- ii) Build on case evidence to identify general improvement areas

Recommendations

1) Streamline grant making: Critical to reduce transaction costs and timeframes to complete

To facilitate this recommendation, the Secretariat has simplified the application form for the Catalytic Fund, Small Grant Facility and Country Programmes and has also put procedures in place to help speed up the grant processing time.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

The Chair of the PAF commented that it is good to have a realistic time frame in mind, and also recommended that the Secretariat move forward with working in the World Bank's systems while investigating alternative disbursement mechanisms – a recommendation which met with general agreement.

Norway also suggested that, where opportunities exist, CA should work with non-traditional partners such as civil society organisations.

2) CA business model focused on partnerships: Assess merit of a shift from simple “one off” grant provider towards partnership / longer term engagements of the Alliance (more than grants)

Member Discussion and Outcomes

EXCO members engaged in a lengthy debate about how to implement this recommendation. The World Bank wanted to know what *country specific framework* and *lead member* meant and suggested that this be clarified in the CA results framework. UN-Habitat was concerned about the perceived portfolio *veto* which is an outcome of improved alignment. Because of its location, CA activities cannot cut across those of its host. The collaboration between the World Bank and the CA Secretariat has been improving and has translated into a far more effective partnership.

While the World Bank holds the legal risk for CA activities and needs to have certain checks and balances, the Secretariat stressed that important upstream work has taken place to continue to minimise or remove the risk of a CA proposal or programme working against the policies of the World Bank. This was also the case with the other CA Members' policies.

Members stressed the importance of the clients' perspective. Germany also pointed to the importance of longer-term support, such as the “Back-up Initiative” and Country Programmes, in the work of the Cities Alliance. The Chair of the PAF, Germany and the World Bank all emphasised the importance of leveraging members' activities. **The Secretariat should review Members' country portfolios, and try to facilitate improved synergy.**

GHK noted that in Douala, where both the World Bank and AFD agreed to work jointly with the government, the project was very successful. GHK also noted that in countries like the

Philippines and Mozambique, where the CA has made significant financial investments, even more impact could have been achieved with the Partnership approach.

The Secretariat welcomed the comments from all the members and stressed that Members agreed that **Country Programmes are going to become a critical tool for the Cities Alliance and its members.** The Secretariat noted that there is no such thing as a CA activity that is not driven by its members. The activities that fail are the ones where members do not take an active role. The Cities Alliance members have expressed a desire to focus on Africa and by supporting new initiatives, such as the AFTUW JWP, the CA will be helping African local governments to respond to the urban transition, not supporting the Bank. The Secretariat agrees with Germany and the World Bank that it must review each member's existing portfolio in-country prior to putting together an exciting, longer-term work programme with national governments, cities and the urban poor. But, the Secretariat stressed that the work programme will not succeed without members driving the process with the Secretariat facilitating, members engaging with each other, adding their own value, and letting each other take the lead where appropriate.

The Secretariat also noted that while it has the Country Programmes and the Back-Up Initiative as tools, it must have access to the flexibility of the Small Grant Facility, which is currently almost paralysed. **The EXCO members reiterated their request to the Secretariat to look for alternative options to move CA funds.**

Members respect the World Bank's duty to mitigate risk, but also stressed the importance for the partnership to be creative, flexible and unique. Norway expressed a desire to see a Country Programme in action, and requested that the next EXCO meeting be held in either Kampala or Accra, so as to be able to sense the results of Cities Alliance Country Programmes.

The Sr. Programme Officer from the World Bank's Global Partnership and Trust Fund Policy Unit, the unit that manages the Development Grant Facility (DGF) and sets the Trust Fund framework, stated that Cities Alliance is recognised as one of their flagship programmes, and is well known for its "shared governance" arrangements and the wide range of members participating in the partnership. The Sr. Officer very much appreciated hearing the EXCO's deliberations and observed both days of the meeting.

- 3) **Strengthen Coherence of Effort: Strengthen Coherence of Effort: Key source of value-added BUT needs more systematic approach to secure alignment among members and joint working**

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Members did not object to this recommendation, but did not discuss it either.

- 4) **Risk Assessments: Assess merit of options for entry strategies and risk assessments for each project or for selected countries**

The Secretariat also supports this recommendation and indicated that in the Country Programmes, this is done easily and naturally. In the Catalytic Fund, the Secretariat envisions more robust Donor Coordination, which will ask Members to consider the institutional arrangements of the application; any duplication of effort, political risk, familiarity with the implementation partners. These questions would also be considered during the appraisal stage. The Secretariat would also like to enhance this process particularly in regards to the WB's Urban Sector Board.

Members Discussion and Outcomes

Germany cautioned that realistic Risk Assessments are complicated and suggested the Secretariat use a check list.

5) Flexible Choice of Mode of Execution: The preference should be what works in any given context

This recommendation was part of the original Terms of Reference of the evaluation. The Secretariat has pushed for client execution with some members questioning the approach. The Secretariat is now proposing a slight modification – to encourage CA members to recommend who implements the proposal. The Secretariat wants to improve efficiency and in most cases, will discourage split execution.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Members did not object to this recommendation, but did not discuss it either.

6) Prepare Three-Year Business Plan with Rolling Annual Plans

The Secretariat is embracing the business plan as a way to fix current problems. The plan will look at FY12-14 and substantially enhance the way Cities Alliance looks at its business. The plan will aim to focus on the outcomes and activities and their respective breakdowns.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Norway expressed support for the business plan and requested that it contain targets, roles and indicators. GHK suggests that it could be a layered plan, with results triggering further investments to grow the organisation. Germany also indicated support for the plan and stated that CG members should have a proactive role in the three-year as well as the annual work plan and must follow the plan so as to be able to raise funds. Additional investment means that the money must be well monitored.

7) Strengthen Knowledge and Learning: Key source of CA value-added BUT *needs more systematic approach* to knowledge capture and sharing – cascade through the suite of CA activities

GHK strongly encouraged the EXCO and the Alliance to strengthen its approach to knowledge and learning, to reflect it in the business plan and underscore its role as a core function of the Cities Alliance.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Members did not object to this recommendation, but did not discuss it either.

Conclusions

The World Bank did not feel that the EXCO should accept the recommendations without a deeper discussion of the implications of each and further direction for the Secretariat so that we can establish clarity and predictability for the Cities Alliance.

The Chair of the PAF and Germany stated that the Cities Alliance is moving to a new level of maturity, with more ambitious interventions. The Chair of the PAF once again reiterated her suggestion that members must see, first hand, the Country Programmes at work.

V. Afternoon Session

Meeting Chair: Emilia Saiz

2. Presentations: Secretariat Updates: Implementation of New Business model

a. Cities Alliance Knowledge Resources, Erika Puspa and Günter Meinert, Secretariat

Web-based CA Proposal and Project Information Database

Erika Puspa of the Secretariat presented the web-based CA Proposal and Project information database which is maintained by the Secretariat so that it can easily manage the CA portfolio. For example, the database was used to produce the “Proposal Approval and Grant Set-Up Processing Time Statistical Summary Fiscal Years 2010 – 2011”

- The database is a tool that can be used to support the knowledge and learning agenda of the Secretariat and the Alliance members
- The information will shortly be searchable by category
- The database will be available to members by June of this year
- The Secretariat follows the World Bank’s rules on Information Disclosure, which the World Bank requested be circulated to the members

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Members found the database very impressive and looked forward to utilising it.

Information vs. Knowledge

The Secretariat has categorised 700 outputs which have been produced from projects between 2006 and 2008. There are an estimated additional 1,000 project outputs generated by projects from 2008 to date, which still need to be categorised for easy access in the project database.

The Secretariat will work on the web site of the Cities Alliance to present the project outputs in a systematised way. The outputs will be clustered as follows:

- Cluster 1: Learning Resources/Toolkits/Training Material
- Cluster 2: Thematic Analysis and Case Studies
- Cluster 3: Research and Data Related Outputs

- Cluster 4: State of the Cities Report

However, this is only a way of facilitating an overview over the universe of the outputs. It would be very rewarding to further process the outputs to generate more aggregated knowledge, drawing on the information and experiences from several projects at a time. The database does not only make the outputs much more accessible individually, but is also opens a range of possibilities of compiling several outputs to generate additional knowledge products. For example, all the outputs dealing with environmental issues can easily be identified now, even if produced by projects which are not primarily aiming at the environment. This allows them to be collectively analysed. The analysis could compare experiences across projects, identify commonalities or differences, etc.

The challenge for members is to identify and prioritise the need for such aggregated knowledge beyond specific project outputs. As an input for the CA Business Plan, and based on the Results Framework aiming at inclusive cities, members need to decide what kind of Knowledge and Learning they expect from the Cities Alliance for the next 2-3 years. The Secretariat does not have sufficient human resources to undertake a major knowledge programme on its own. Members are strongly encouraged to analyse their possibilities to engage in a joint work programme, preferably with at least one more CA member, to generate knowledge products in high demand by our partners. This would require additional investments in form of staff time and CA grant funding, but is certainly justified to better leverage the multi-million dollar investment already made for the CA-supported projects.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Norway was interested to know how the database is linked not only to the World Bank's Urbanisation Knowledge Platform, but also to the World Bank's Knowledge Database. Norway also expressed a desire to focus not only on outputs, but to take it a step further and focus on outcomes – where the learning occurs.

The Secretariat indicated that the relationship to the Urbanisation Knowledge Platform is yet to be determined, but it should obviously feed into this and other members' knowledge platforms such as the WUF, the WUC, etc. Whatever CA generates should feedback into the CA member system.

The Secretariat was tasked with following up with individual members to find out what they would like to see generated from CA's knowledge and learning programme. The Secretariat will present initial proposals to ExCo in July, related to the (draft) business plan.

b. Catalytic Fund Update, Federico Silva, Secretariat

Based on member feedback from the Mexico City presentation, the following adjustments were made to speed up the process:

- The Secretariat made the Concept Note a one step process ;
- The evaluation processes will run in parallel: donor coordination, World Bank Country Director concurrence, and evaluation by the Expert Evaluation Panel (CVs on file for member review); and
- Once a full proposal is received and passes the final screening, they will be processed immediately.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

It was clarified that civil society organisations can apply if there is support from a member and the national government. NGO organisations from the north are not precluded from applying, so there is opportunity to introduce new partners to the Cities Alliance.

The Catalytic Fund was advertised to all members, but not advertised externally due to budget restraints as well as Secretariat capacity.

Norway requested that the members consider wider advertisement in the future. UCLG informed that the World Organization had done selective dissemination and would be ready to do broader dissemination if capacity and budget availability so allowed.

c. Country Programme Update, Julian Baskin, Secretariat

The principles of the CA Country Programmes are:

- Coherence of effort
- Long-term, pro-poor urban programming
- Multi-sectoral and aligned approach
- Demand-oriented programme design process
- Building long-term institutional capacities
- Engaging for systemic change and impacts at scale

Uganda: *Municipalities of Arua, Jinja, Kabale, Mbale and Mbarara*

- CA Members: HFHI, SDI, UCLG, UN-HABITAT, World Bank
- Methodology: Full project document developed with member participation which was circulated through the Donor Coordination process
- National and Municipal Urban Forums launched, and first part of National Urban Policy Dialogue finalised
- Communities mobilising in all 5 municipalities - saving groups, settlement profiles and enumerations, participation in urban forums
- Local Governments being mobilised through the Urban Authorities Association of Uganda (UAAU) supported by ICMA

Early Results include:

- Local, National, and International exchanges between slum dweller committees has been conducted
- Settlement Profiles in all five municipalities have been finalised (61 slum settlements)
- 199 Saving Groups has been formed with 2,782 male savers and 8,096 female savers
- Community development committees are established in all settlements, networks and at the city level
- SDI is member of the National Executive committee of the National Urban Forum
- The Uganda federation and the SDI affiliate NGO have representation in the executive committees of the 5 Municipal Development Forums

- The draft Operational Manual for the Community Upgrading Fund is being finalised
- The UAAU/ICMA partnership is being launched with a workshop at end of March
- A CDS methodology drawing on stakeholder and national experience is under development

Ghana: *Greater Accra Metro Area and selected secondary cities (TBD)*

- CA Members: AFD, GTZ, HFHI, SDI, UN-HABITAT, World Bank
- Programme Methodology: Members identified gaps and will submit eight separate grants that will form the programme and all of them will be circulated for Donor Coordination
- Space provided for a national debate around alternatives to forced evictions
- Member collaboration initiated on (i) municipal capacity building; (ii) community empowerment
- Advocacy and awareness raising proposal being finalised

List of Programme Grants with Recipients:

1. Cities Advocacy and Awareness Framework - Info. For Change Initiative
2. Consultations on municipal services options for GAMA - World Bank
3. State of Ghanaian Cities Report - KNUST
4. Ministry of Local Government Inclusive National Urban Agenda - GIZ
5. Urban Local Government Capacity building -ILGS
6. Community empowerment and capacity building – SDI
7. Incremental housing - HFHI
8. Greater Accra Human Settlement Strategy - TBD

Vietnam: *Cities TBD*

- CA Members: WB, WBI, UN Habitat, UCLG through ACVN, SDI through ACHR
- Programme Methodology: working directly with community groups, the programme will bring to scale already tested methodologies through seven grants

List of Programme Grants with Recipients:

- Vietnam National Urbanization Review – World Bank’s Urban Anchor
- Strengthen the Vietnam Urban Forum – Ministry of Construction (WB)
- Operationalising the National Urban Upgrading Strategy – Ministry of Construction (WB)
- Training for local authorities on strategic urban management - Ministry of Construction (WB)
- Support for ACVN – ACHR(UCLG)
- Consolidating management and implementation of the CDF through ACVN – ACVN(UCLG)
- Support the existing CDF network to implement and scale up small projects – ACHR(SDI)

Burkina Faso: *Cities TBD*

- CA Members: TBD
- Programme Methodology: TBD

After selection by the EXCO in Mexico City, the World Bank offered and the Secretariat accepted, to send a letter to the Government of Burkina Faso expressing interest in engaging. Interested CA members have been invited to participate in a joint mission to Ouagadougou in the next few months.

Based on the number of existing Cities Alliance grants, the next two potential country programmes are Malawi and Mozambique. The Secretariat is undertaking a portfolio review of each country and hopes to make a recommendation at the next EXCO meeting.

The Country Programme team is also working on linking the Country Programmes to the CA Africa Work Programme.

Member Discussion and Outcomes

Germany, UCLG and UN-Habitat requested more advanced information on the Country Programmes, which are new to the members and the nuances of each programme are difficult to immediately grasp. The Secretariat was requested to produce advanced information on the programmes as well as a progress report including the framework – what was agreed, what has been achieved, and the budget for each programme. Norway finds the reporting on the Country Programmes to be very positive and is very encouraged. Norway expressed a desire to learn by doing and echoed the PAF Chairperson’s suggestion to hold the next EXCO in Ghana. The EXCO Chair agreed to consider the option of Ghana as the next venue for the EXCO.

The Secretariat explained that each programme approach is slightly different and with Burkina Faso, one member has taken the lead to engage with the Government from HQ as opposed to using Field Staff. The Secretariat is following up with AFTUW and will work with them and all interested CA members to move the programme forward on equal footing for all members.

3. Charter Update

a. Andrea Stumpf, World Bank Legal Counsel, Sustainable Development Network (SDN) and William Cobbett, Secretariat

In Mexico City, the Cities Alliance adopted its new Charter subject to final advice from the World Bank’s legal team. The Secretariat has been working with the Legal team and has resolved 99% of the issues –consistency of language and clarity of terms. The lawyers focused on the flow of movement from the Charter to the funding vehicle and have not meant to circumvent the work of the EXCO. The Legal team think this is very good practice and would like to support the Cities Alliance in this session.

The fully detailed tracked changes version is available for members to review. World Bank Legal Counsel Andrea Stumpf, an expert on Partnership Programmes, and Maria Lourdes Pardo, the Cities Alliance’s primary legal counsel, joined the meeting and went through the Charter (version 10 February 2011) page by page with the EXCO members.

The EXCO asked the Legal Counsel team to draft the necessary legal language where required, and the Secretariat will circulate the final version of the Charter to the CG shortly.

4. Update on the Independent Evaluation 2011, Günter Meinert

The Secretariat received member feedback from the Mexico City presentation of the Terms of Reference (TOR), incorporated member comments, circulated the new version and had no objection. The Secretariat received some editorial edits from IEG on the final TOR and received 25 Expressions of Interest (EOIs) which were reviewed by a small committee consisting of representatives from UN-Habitat, Norway, the World Bank Urban and Local Government Unit and the Secretariat. Fourteen EOIs made the shortlist, and World Bank guidelines require the preparation of between 1-6 full proposals. This same committee will act as the oversight sub-committee referenced in the TOR. The Secretariat requested a World Bank exception to allow external people to participate in the process. **The EXCO decided to ask for three full proposals from Universalia, COWI and DEGE.**

5. Membership Issues

In the new Charter of the Cities Alliance, members who fail to make their agreed financial contribution for two consecutive financial years will no longer be members of the Consultative Group and will be notified accordingly by EXCO.

The Secretariat presented the following status report:

1. **DFID** – membership expires at the end of March 2011; the Secretariat has had no formal decision from them to leave the CA
2. **Netherlands** – 2008 – will not be a member
3. **Philippines** – 2008 – last contribution – required to pay \$50k/year
4. **UNEP** has not paid since 2009
5. **UN-Habitat** has not paid fees since 2007(cash) and has not provided an in-kind secondment since March 2010
6. **USAID** – is paid up

Germany found the arrears quite serious as these are legal obligations. Germany suggested the Chair of the EXCO write a letter to each organisation highlighting the importance of this matter.

The Chair of the PAF offered to follow-up to the EXCO letter and write to the DFID Minister.

It was agreed that letters would be issued by the Chair of the EXCO to the members listed above.

6. Secretariat Staff Update

The EXCO agreed that the staffing is an issue for the Secretariat to handle. The Secretariat gave a brief updated:

1. Sr. Urban Specialist - GIZ Secondee Günter Meinert is rotating back to Germany after four years and departs in July 2011
 - a. New GIZ secondee (Rene Hohmann) will arrive in June 2011
2. Two Research Analysts funded by Norway – Hilde Refstie and Ricardo Jimenez – are both leaving at the end of April/May 2011
 - a. Posts are not being filled
3. AFD Special assignment – Thierry Paulais – will leave in September 2011
 - a. Post is not being filled
4. Urban Specialist (Andrea Merrick) on Developmental Assignment (DAIS) inside the WB and will most likely not return
 - a. Post is unfilled at the moment
5. The French MFA is sending an Urban Specialist secondee to assist with the Francophone portfolio
 - a. Estimated arrival date – later this year
6. UN-Habitat Senior Secondee
 - a. Terms of Reference has finally been agreed but there is a hiring freeze in UN-Habitat for the next few months

7. Business Plan Development and FY12 budget

Based on recommendations from the GHK evaluation and the Working Group, the Secretariat proposes to develop a three-year business plan (FY12-FY14), which would serve as the main operating document of the partnership. It would incorporate the objectives, strategy, results framework, outcome targets, main activities and annual work programme in a single document. Reporting to CG and EXCO would be made against the Business Plan.

The Business Plan would be organised around the over-arching objectives in the new CA Charter, as captured in the CA Results Framework and supported by the theory of change, presented at EXCO and CG meetings during 2010. The Secretariat will circulate the Results Framework, proposed to focus on global/regional and country outcomes, around which the Business Plan will be organised. The Business Plan will include indicators and main activities over the planning period, supported by detailed annual work programmes, submitted annually for EXCO approval and CG ratification. It would be developed strategically with members over the course of the coming year, based on assumed funding levels over the period specified by the Plan. In addition, a proposed Africa work programme (action plan) will be developed, for which additional resources will be mobilised.

As next steps, the Secretariat will develop an annotated outline of the Business Plan for the next EXCO meeting (July 2011), along with the proposed FY12 work programme and budget in the outcome-oriented format proposed for the Plan. A working draft, including work programme options and strategic orientation, would be reviewed with the CG at its 2011 meeting (Nov./Dec. 2011).

The annual work programme included in the Plan would include the outcomes from all on-going as well as proposed new activities. The Secretariat proposes to use the Business Plan as a tool to help build improved coherence and synergies among CA members, bring an increased focus on results, and to provide outcome-oriented planning, monitoring and reporting system. The CA project database will be enhanced to support this type of results reporting.

8. Next EXCO Meeting and Consultative Group Meeting

The next EXCO meeting will either be held in Ghana or Germany, 11-12 July 2011. The Secretariat will follow-up and confirm to members shortly.

The next CG is on track to be held in Maputo. The EXCO members were asked to send the Secretariat blackout dates. The CG meeting may have to be moved to December 2011.

As this would be the last meeting for Hilde Refstie and Ricardo Jimenez, the EXCO thanked them both for their dedicated work to the CA and asked them to say a few words.

ANNEX 1

The Cities Alliance
Executive Committee Meeting, 10-11 March 2011

AGENDA

Venue: World Bank Headquarters,
1818 H Street, NW, Washington, DC 20433 Tel: 1-202-458-7269

DAY 1: THURSDAY, 10 MARCH 2011

09h30 - 10h00	Welcome Coffee/Tea	Venue: Room MC4-100
10h00 – 12h00	Book Launch: Triumph of the City: How Our Greatest Invention Makes Us Richer, Smarter, Greener, Healthier, and Happier by Edward Glaeser	Venue: Preston Auditorium
12h30 - 13h30	<p>***** Lunch *****</p>	Venue: Executive Dining Rooms – MC-C1
13h30 – 14h00	<p>Opening and Welcome</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Zoubida Allaoua, Director, Finance, Economics and Urban Unit, World Bank ➤ Elisabeth Gateau, former EXCO Chairperson 	
14h00 - 15h00	<p>Strategic Priorities for the Cities Alliance Partnership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Secretariat Overview presentation William Cobbett, Secretariat Manager ➤ The World Bank’s Urban Strategy for Africa presentation Junaid Kamal Ahmad, Sector Manager, Urban and Water, Africa Region, World Bank <p>Member Discussion</p>	Handouts: AFTUW JWP; WB Urbanisation KP Summary; WB Urbanisation KP Full document
15h00 – 15h30	Coffee/Tea Break	
15h30 - 16h30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Urbanisation Knowledge Platform presentation Abha Joshi-Ghani, Manager, Urban Development and Local Government Unit, World Bank <p>Member Discussion</p>	

16h30 – 17h00	Coffee/Tea Break	
17h00 – 18h00	<p>Presentation: Update on Cities Alliance Grant Making Phyllis Kibui, Secretariat</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ With Lydia Kruse Tietz, Trust Fund Coordinator and Senior Resource Management Officer, Sustainable Development Network (SDN) <p>Member Discussion</p>	
18h00-18h15	<p>Closing Remarks Clarence Anthony, interim EXCO Chairperson</p>	Venue: 2000 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW WDC (202-296-7700)
20h00	<p>Group Dinner - Kinkead's Restaurant</p>	

DAY 2: FRIDAY 11 MARCH 2011

09h00 - 09h30	Coffee/Tea	Venue: Room MC4-100
09h30 – 12h30	<p>Summary of 10 March Discussions Clarence Anthony, interim EXCO Chairperson</p> <p>Cities Alliance as an Effective Partnership</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Secretariat Overview Presentation William Cobbett, Secretariat Manager ➤ Lessons and Recommendations from the GHK evaluation of Project Implementation Modalities Jamie Simpson, GHK International, Director ➤ Presentation: Secretariat Response to GHK Recommendations Kevin Milroy, Secretariat ➤ Discussion: Comparative Advantage and Value Added of the Cities Alliance ➤ Discussion: Role of CA Members, the Secretariat, the Policy Advisory Forum and CA Partners <p>Next Steps</p>	Handouts: GHK Draft Final Report
12h30 - 14h00	<p style="text-align: center;">***** Lunch *****</p>	Venue: Executive Dining Rooms – MC-C1

<p>14h00 - 15h00</p>	<p>Secretariat Updates: Implementation of New Business model</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Catalytic Fund (CATF) ➤ Country Programmes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Uganda, Ghana, Vietnam and Burkina Faso ➤ Cities Alliance Knowledge Resources 	<p>Venue: Room MC4-100</p>
<p>15h00 – 15h30</p>	<p>Coffee/Tea</p>	
<p>15h30 - 17h30</p>	<p>Presentation: Cities Alliance Partnership Matters & Business Matters William Cobbett and Kevin Milroy, Secretariat</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Charter Update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ With Andrea Stumpf, World Bank Legal Counsel, Sustainable Development Network (SDN) ➤ Update on the Independent Evaluation 2011 ➤ Membership Issues ➤ Secretariat Staffing Update ➤ Business Plan Development and FY12 budget ➤ Next EXCO Meeting and Consultative Group Meeting ➤ Any other business 	<p>Handout: Charter version with WB Legal Tracked Changes; Background Documents: Financial Budget and Report, FY10-FY11(from Mexico City Meeting)</p>
<p>17h30 - 18h00</p>	<p>Closing Remarks Clarence Anthony, interim EXCO Chairperson</p>	